

## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY FOR THE AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY

STANDING COMMITTEE ON ADMINISTRATION AND PROCEDURE Speaker Ms Joy Burch MLA (Chair), Ms Nicole Lawder MLA (Deputy Chair), Ms Suzanne Orr MLA, Mr Andrew Braddock MLA

## **Submission Cover sheet**

Review of the Standing Orders and Continuing Resolutions of the Tenth Assembly

Submission number: 002

Date authorised for publication: 28 November 2022



## Nicole Lawder MLA

**Opposition Whip** 

Tom Duncan Secretary Standing Committee on Administration and Procedure ACT Legislative Assembly GPO Box 1020 CANBERRA ACT 2601 e-mail – <u>LACommitteeAPC@parliament.act.gov.au</u>

Dear Mr Duncan,

10<sup>th</sup> Assembly Review of Standing Orders

At the meeting of the Legislative Assembly held on 21 September 2022, the Speaker, as Presiding Member of the Standing Committee on Administration and Procedure, advised Members of the Assembly of the Committee's intention to conduct a review of the current Standing Orders.

As Opposition Whip, I have consulted with my colleagues from the Canberra Liberals and this document contains a consolidated response from the Opposition.

These comments are based on <u>https://www.parliament.act.gov.au/parliamentary-business/in-the-chamber/standing-orders</u>

If you have any questions on the matters outlined in this submission, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely,

Nicole Lawder

**Opposition Whip** 

13 December 2022

## Summary of comments:

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion
1	Proceeding	No comment
	<u>s</u> for the	
	meeting of Assembly:	
2	<u>Speaker,</u> Chief	No comment
	Minister,	
	Deputy Speaker,	
	Leader of	
	the	
	Opposition and Officers	
3	Administrat	16. (a) A Standing Committee on Administration and
	<u>ion and</u> <u>Procedure</u>	Procedure is established at the commencement of each
	Committee	Assembly to:
		(i) undertake self-referred inquiries or inquiries
		referred by the Assembly and, in addition, in
		the third year of an Assembly term the committee shall inquire into and report on
		the operation of the standing orders and
		continuing resolutions of the Assembly with a
		view to ensuring that the practices and
		procedures of the Assembly remain relevant
		and reflect best practice; (Amended 29 November 2018)
		Comment: This year we started the review in the 2 <sup>nd</sup> year. Change wording so it can be more flexible.
4	<u>Administrat</u> ion	Leave of absence
		22. A Member may be granted leave of absence from the Assembly, on motion moved without notice, stating the reason for leave and the period of absence. Except that a Member who is pregnant shall be entitled, without a
		vote of the Assembly, to 18 weeks maternity leave of absence, and that leave shall commence at a time

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion
		notified by the Member to the Speaker. (Amended 6 March
		2008, 29 November 2018 and 21 March 2019)
		Comment: Does not mention paternity leave/parental leave/
		adoption leave. Out of step with community standards.
5	Sitting and	
	<u>adjournme</u>	Prayer or Reflection
	nt of the	
	Assembly	30. Upon the Speaker taking the Chair at the
		commencement of each sitting, and a quorum of
		Members being present, the following shall be read:
		Members, at the beginning of this sitting of the
		Assembly, I would ask you to stand in silence and
		pray or reflect on our responsibilities to the people
		of the Australian Capital Territory. (Amended 1 June 1995)
		1995)
		The Speaker shall also acknowledge, at the beginning of
		each sitting day, that the Assembly is meeting on the
		lands of the traditional custodians. (Amended 6 March 2008,
		2 April 2009 and 10 May 2018) Vs 42A(a) English first
		Comment: Need to add in Acknowledgement of country in
		language, which usually comes before the Prayer or Reflection.
		So the order in the Standing Orders, should reflect the actual
		practice. Also that it is in language with translation following.
		Currently this is at odds with SO 42 A which says English
		translation should be prior to other language.
		Suggestion: The Speaker shall acknowledge, at the beginning of
		each sitting day, that the Assembly is meeting on the lands of
		the traditional custodians. (Amended 6 March 2008, 2 April 2009 and 10
6	Rules of	May 2018) Vs 42A(a) English first
6	debate	Speaking in a language other than English
		42A. A Member may, when called by the Chair, rise and speak
		in any language other than English so long as:
		(a) an oral translation is provided in the English language by
		the same Member immediately prior to the words
		spoken in the language other than English; and

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion			
		(b) a written translation in both English and the language used is provided to the Clerk within one hour following			
		the contribution by the Member speaking. (Inserted 29			
		November 2018)			
		Comment: this is not what happens in practice with the			
		acknowledgement of country. The welcome in language is			
		spoken before the oral translation, not after. Wording to be changed to make consistent with practice.			
		Use of Queen's, Governor-General's or Governor's name			
		53. A Member may not use the name of Her Majesty or her representatives in Australia disrespectfully in debate, nor for the purpose of influencing the Assembly in its deliberations.			
		Comment: Reference to Queen and Her Majesty to be updated.			
7	<b>Business</b>				
		Routine of business			
		74. The Assembly shall proceed each day with its ordinary business in the following routine:			
		Prayer or reflection			
		Presentation of petitions			
		Ministerial statements			
		Notices and orders of the day			
		Questions without notice			
		Presentation of papers Private Members' business			
		Ministerial statements			
		Notices and orders of the day:			
		Comments: Does not include the Aboriginal welcome.			
		Presentation of petition responses to be added after petitions.			
		Why is Ministerial statements there twice?			
		provided that at 2 pm on each day the Speaker shall			
		interrupt the business before the Assembly in order that			

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion		
		questions without notice shall be called on, and (Temporary order 9 December 2008. Adopted 3 May 2012. Amended 27 November 2012, 4 June 2015, 29 November 2018 and 30 March 2021)		
		Comment: We start QT at 2pm, why is this needed?		
		<ul> <li>(a) if a vote is in progress at the time fixed for interruption, that vote, and any vote consequent upon that vote, shall be completed and the result announced; and</li> </ul>		
		(b) the Speaker shall fix a later hour for the resumption of the debate on any business under discussion and not disposed of at the time of interruption; (Amended 4 May 1995, 1 June 1995 and 2 April 2009)		
		provided further that, in relation to ministerial statements, copies shall be provided to the Speaker for circulation to all Members two hours prior to the time at which the statement is proposed to be made; and that Ministers shall table a copy of the statement and move that the paper be noted. (Adopted 27 November 2012. Amended 4 June 2015)		
		Suggested change: Ministers shall table a copy of the statement and move that the paper be noted. Statements shall not be read out except in exceptional circumstances, by leave. A Minister can speak for up to 2 minutes to explain why reading out a statement is warranted, then seek leave.		
		Significant parts of sitting days are taken up by Ministerial Statements. There is no reason the majority of these statements should not be tabled only. If it is important it can be a substantive motion etc.		
		The available time can be allocated to an additional motion, scheduled to rotated between parties, allowing more inclusive and genuine debate instead of statements made by Ministers, about Ministers and for Ministers. For the occasions where a statement does need to be read, these can be moved by leave.		

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion
		New business
		76. New business may not be taken after 10 pm unless otherwise ordered prior to 9 pm. (Amended 6 March 2008 and 29 November 2018)
		Comment: Do we still need this? le do we ever go to 10pm? Can we make it 7 pm or 8pm for example?
8	Petitions	Suggestion: Should contain rules about not identifying someone. Ref public housing petition
9	Notices of motion	Notice of motion – how given
		101. Notice of motion shall be given by delivering a copy of its terms to the Clerk in the Chamber during a sitting. The notice must be signed by the Member, (if a co-sponsored motion, by both Members whose names are on the notice).
		Except that a proposed notice of motion to be considered by the Standing Committee on Administration and Procedure under standing order 16(a)(iii) must be delivered to the Clerk no later than 12 noon on the Monday of the sitting week at which it is proposed to be moved. (Amended 6 March 2008, 13 December 2016 and 29 November 2018)
		Suggestion: Delivered in Hard copy (signed) as well as electronic.
		No contingent notice
		108. A Member shall not give a contingent notice of motion.
		Comment: Don't even know what this means after 10 years here.
10	Questions seeking information	Questions without notice and questions on notice 113. (a) A Member may ask a question in writing to be placed on the <i>Questions on Notice Paper</i> for written reply. Such questions shall be lodged with the Clerk, in

Chapter	Title	Comme	ent/suggestion
		b	oth hard copy and electronically by 12 noon of a sitting
		d	ay. (Amended 29 November 2018)
		Commer	t: is this consistent with new database requirements.
		a	uestions without notice – number of questions
		n a n A re	Questions without notice shall not be concluded until on-Executive Members seeking to ask a question have sked at least the number of questions equivalent to the umber of non-Executive Members present in the ssembly on that day from either party or group epresented in the Assembly. <i>(Adopted 15 September 1994.</i> mended 29 November 2018 and 2 June 2022)
		n so m v re p re	at: The Party should still be entitled to ask a QWON ie ot lose the opportunity to ask Questions because omeone (or more than one person) is on sick leave, naternity leave, for example. The number of questions without notice should reflect the number of elected epresentatives, as opposed to the number of members resent. This will allow the number of questions to emain at the same level (eg 9 this term) when an MLA is n leave.
		u h to	on: Questions without notice shall not be concluded ntil non-Executive Members seeking to ask a question ave asked at least the number of questions equivalent o the number of non-Executive Members elected from ither party or group represented in the Assembly.
		R	ules for all questions
		117. T	he following general rules shall apply to questions:
		(a	a) questions shall be brief and relate to a single issue;
		(t	b) questions shall not contain:
			(i) statements of fact or names of persons unless they are strictly necessary to render the

Chapter	Title	Comment/	/suggestion
			question intelligible and the facts can be authenticated;
			(ii) arguments;
			(iii) inferences;
			(iv) imputations;
			(v) ironical expressions; or
			(vi) hypothetical matters;
		(c)	questions shall not ask Ministers:
			(i) for an expression of opinion;
			<ul> <li>to announce Executive policy, but may seek an explanation regarding the policy of the Executive and its application, and may ask the Chief Minister whether a Minister's statement represents Executive policy; or</li> </ul>
			(iii) for a legal opinion;
		(d)	questions shall not be asked which reflect on or are critical of the character or conduct of those persons whose conduct may only be challenged on a substantive motion, and notice must be given of questions critical of the character or conduct of other persons;
		(e)	questions shall not refer to proceedings in committee not yet published or anticipate the outcome of a committee inquiry;
		(f)	the Speaker may direct that the language of a question be changed, if, in the opinion of the Speaker, it is unbecoming or does not conform with the standing order;
		(g)	a question fully answered cannot be re-asked. (Amended 6 March 2008 and 29 November 2018)

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion			
		Comment: Currently, questions without notice must be drafte and can be ruled out of order under a range of rules above and beyond those applied in the normal standards for parliamenta debate. Rules for questions state they must not contain 'ironic expressions', 'inferences' or 'imputations.' However, there are no such constraints on the answers.	d ary cal		
		This leads to an unbalanced situation where the questions have to be very carefully worded, but the answers can – and often a - full of ironic expressions, inferences and imputations. As just one example, In a recent question time (24 Nov 2022), the Chi Minister's first words where "If Mr Cain could stay awake for earlier, or stay awake for any questions, he would know" There other examples in nearly every question time where a responding Minister attacks the questioner rather than answe the question.	are ief		
		It is submitted then that the rules restricting questions should also be used to curtail the answers.			
		If this is argued as being unnecessary due to the normal rules debate, that should also apply to the questions themselves.	of		
		In either case, the rules should be the same for both questions and answers in question time.	S		
		Suggestion: rules governing questions should equally apply to answers.			
		Answers to questions without notice			
		118. The answer to a question without notice:			
		<ul> <li>(a) shall be concise and directly relevant to the subject matter of the question (<i>Temporary order 9 December 2008. Adopted 22 March 2012</i>); and</li> </ul>			
		<ul> <li>(b) shall not debate the subject to which the questio refers; and</li> </ul>	'n		
		Comment: see above comments on rules governing questions			
		which should equally apply to answers.			
		Suggestion: in 118 (b) "shall not introduce matter extraneous the question and shall not debate the subject to which the question refers; and	to		

Chapter	Title	Comn	nent/suggestion	
			Request for explanation concerning unanswered	
			question	
		118A.	If a Minister does not answer a question on notice (including a question taken on notice during questions without notice) asked by a Member, within 30 days of the asking of that question, and does not, within that period, provide to the Member who asked the question an explanation or statement satisfactory to that Member of why an answer has not yet been provided, then:	
			(a) at the conclusion of questions without notice on	
			any day after that period, that Member may ask	
			the relevant Minister for such an explanation or a	
			statement in relation to the question; and	
			(b) the Member may, at the conclusion of the	
			explanation or statement, move without notice	
			"That the Assembly takes note of the explanation";	
			or	
			(c) in the event that the Minister does not provide an explanation or statement to the satisfaction of the	
			Member, that Member may, without notice, move	
			a motion with regard to the Minister's failure to provide an answer, or an explanation or a	
			statement. (Adopted 4 May 1995. Amended 6 March 2008)	
		119.	(Standing order omitted 6 March 2008)	
		'take r question merely that que A rese	ent: re 118A (b) In the Senate, there is the practice to note' of an answer. This is when a Minister, in answering a on, omits, mistreats of misrepresents information or attacks the questioner. In the senate, it is possible for uestioner to hold the Minister to account for their answer. arch paper by Mr Richard Pye, Clerk of the Senate, in 2017 the use and purposes of this treatment, and notes:	
			te standing orders provide that, at the end of question	
			ach day, 30 minutes be allocated to debating answers hat day. The order has been in place for nearly a quarter	
		-	ntury, and is now regarded as an essential part of	
		questi	on time each day. It is one of several opportunities each	

Chapter	Title	Comm	ent/suggestion
		day for	non-government senators to initiate debates of general ical interest."
		orders t counter the Sen at: <u>httr</u>	tion: Motions to take note become part of the standing for the Assembly to allow members the chance to rpoint the answers provided by Ministers as is the case in late. A copy of the research paper is available <u>os://www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/lcdocs/submissions/57</u> <u>10%20Richard%20Pye.pdf</u>
		someth explana	ent: With respect to 118A (cb) A Minister often says ing like "I will check where it is up to". That is not an ation. So, then what? What's the point of this? Could we simpler/clearer.
		session express	tion: Members may also make a statement within the allocated for "Matters arising from Question Time" to their views on the failure of a Minister to respond within eframe. 2 minutes per unanswered Question.
		119.	(Standing order omitted 6 March 2008)
			Questions on Notice
			Questions on Notice shall be given by a Member delivering it to the Clerk within such time as, in the opinion of the Speaker, will enable the question to be fairly printed. The question shall be fairly written and signed by the Member. <i>(Amended 6 March 2008)</i>
		Suggest	tion: Update language now it is online.
		121.	(Standing order omitted 6 March 2008)
			Answers to questions on notice
			The answer to a question on notice shall be given by delivering a hard copy and an electronic copy to the Clerk. A copy shall be supplied to the Member who asked the question and the question and answer shall be printed in <i>Hansard</i> . ( <i>Amended 29 November 2018</i> )
		Suggest	tion: Update language now it is online.

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion		
		Suggestion: Reinstatement of questions on notice to the Notice		
		Paper		
		New 122a The Speaker may direct that a question or part of a question on notice which has been answered be reinstated to the Notice Paper, if following a request of the Member asking the question, the Speaker is of the opinion that the question has not been fully answered.		
11	<u>Motions</u> , questions, votes and resolutions	No comment		
12	Amendmen ts	No comment		
13	<u>Orders</u> of the day	No comment		
14	Voting/divis	No comment		
15	<u>Bills</u>	No comment		
16	Financial procedures	This is not very clear or helpful. It could be argued that just about every motion relates to expenditure eg more mowing, more buses, reduce cost of living, more police, autoimmune awareness campaign.		
17	Disorder	No comment		
18	Strangers	No comment		
19	Papers and documents	No comment		
20	<u>Committee</u> <u>s</u>	Membership of committees should take into consideration a gender balance to be more reflective of society.		
21	Witnesses	No comment		
22	<b>Balloting</b>	No comment		
23	Addresses to the Queen or the Governor General	This chapter sets out the procedures relating to addresses to the Queen or the Governor- General and responses from the Governor- General.		
		How moved		
		268. Subject to standing order 126, whenever it is deemed proper to present an address to Her Majesty or the		

Chapter       Title       Comment/suggestion         Governor-General, a motion on notice state       Governor-General, a motion on notice state         of the proposed address shall be moved.       Addresses to Queen sent to Governor-General         Addresses to Queen sent to Governor-General       Speaker	ting the terms
of the proposed address shall be moved. Addresses to Queen sent to Governor-Ge	-
Addresses to Queen sent to Governor-Ge	
Speaker	neral by
269. Addresses to Her Majesty shall be transmi	
Governor-General by the Speaker, who sh	-
Governor-General to cause them to be for	warded for
presentation.	
Comment: Obviously the references to the Queer	Hor Majosty
need to be changed.	i/fiel widjesty
24 <u>Standing</u> No comment	
orders	
25 <u>General</u> No comment	
<u>rule</u> for	
conduct of	
business	
26 <u>Privilege</u> No comment	
and contempt	
Continui Authority No comment	
ng to publish	
Resoluti Hansard	
on 1	
Continui Authority No comment	
ng for	
Resoluti legislative	
on 1A assembly	
to be	
migrated	
to, and	
stored and	
processed	
by, a cloud	
service	
provider	
Continui Authority No comment ng to receive	
ng to receive Resoluti <u>resignation</u>	
on 2 of members	
Continui <u>Broadcastin</u> No comment	
ng guidelines	

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion
Resoluti		
on 3		
Continui ng Resoluti on 4	Citizen's right of reply	Can it be made clearer that the person does not get to speak, and/or the statement/submission is or isn't read out? How does it get into Hansard? Ie is it tabled? By whom? Is there a vote in the Assembly?
Continui ng Resoluti on 4A	Claims of parliamenta ry privilege that arise during the exercise of the ACT Integrity Commissio ns' powers and functions	No comment
Continui ng Resoluti on 5	Code of conduct for all members of the Legislative Assembly for the Australian Capital Territory	No comment
Continui ng Resoluti on 5AA	Commissio ner for Standards	No comment
Continui ng Resoluti on5A	Considerati on of statutory appointme nts	No comment
Continui ng Resoluti on 6	Declaration of provide interests of Members	No comment
Continui ng	Ethics and Integrity Adviser	No comment

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion
Resoluti		
on 6A		
Continui	Freedom of	No comment
ng	speech	
Resoluti		
on 7		
Continui	Implementa	No comment
ng	tion of	
Resoluti	Committee	
on 8	recommen	
	dations in	
	annual	
	reports	
Continui	Independen	No comment
ng	ce of the	
Resoluti	Assembly	
on 8AA	from	
	religious	
	faith	
Continui	Latimer	No comment
ng	House	
Resoluti	Principles	
on 8A		
Continui	Lobbyist	No comment
ng	Register –	
Resoluti	ACT	
on 8AB	Lobbying	
	Code of	
	Conduct	
Continui	Lobbyist	No comment
ng	Register –	
Resoluti	ACT	
on 8AC	Lobbyist	
	Regulation	
	Guidelines	
Continui	Public	No comment
ng	Interest	
Resoluti	Immunity	
on 8B	-	
Continui	Senator for	No comment
ng	the ACT –	
Resoluti	Procedures	
on 9	for election	
Continui	Sub judice	No comment
ng	-	
~		

Chapter	Title	Comment/suggestion
Resoluti		
on 10		
Continui	<u>Title</u> of	Suggestion: Should the Speaker have option to determine how
ng	Presiding	they are referred to? For example we currently have Madam
Resoluti	Officer	Speaker.
on 11		
Other		Suggestion: Should the continuing resolution about an equitable distribution of questions during Question Time be in Standing Orders?
		Suggestion: Party whips be provided evidence of any previous agreements made between parties. E.g., Personal pairs agreement.